

**Meeting Date:** December 12, 2016 1:30 - 4:30pm

**Meeting Attendees:**

Department of Transportation

Federal Transit Administration

- **Henrika Buchanan**, Associate Administrator for Program Management
- **Greg Danis**, Equal Opportunity Specialist
- **Carolyn Flowers**, Acting Administrator
- **Mary Leary**, Director of Technical Assistance and Workforce Development
- **Danielle Nelson**, Health and Transportation Program Specialist
- **Rik Opstelten**, Mobility Innovation Program Analyst
- **Bruce Robinson**, Deputy Associate Administrator for Program Management
- **Kimberly Sledge**, Director of the Office of Transit Programs
- **Marianne Stock**, Rural and Targeted Programs Division Chief

Department of Health and Human Services

Office of the Assistant Secretary for Health

- **Thomas Novotny**, Deputy Assistant Secretary for Health (Science and Medicine)
- **Mary Worstell**, Senior Advisor to the Deputy Assistant Secretary for Health (Science and Medicine)
- **Alan Simon**, Medical Officer

Administration for Community Living

- **Katherine Cargill-Willis**, Intellectual and Developmental Disabilities Program Analyst
- **Lori Gerhard**, Director of the Office of Consumer Access & Self-Determination
- **Jesse Moore**, Aging Services Program Specialist

Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services

- **Sheri Gaskins**, Technical Director of the Division of Benefits and Coverage
- **Kirsten Jensen**, Director of the Division of Benefits and Coverage

Substance Abuse and Mental Health Services Administration

- **Eric Weakly**, Chief of the Division of State and Community Systems Development

Health Resources Services Administration

- **Diana Espinosa**, Deputy Administrator
- **Tracey Orloff**, Director of the Division of Strategic Partnerships

Department of Agriculture

Food and Nutrition Service

- **Tony Craddock, Jr.**, Federal Partnerships Portfolio Manager

Department of Labor

Office of Disability Employment Policy

- **Nadia Ibrahim**, Public Health Analyst
- **Mike Reardon**, Supervisory Policy Advisor for Employment-Related Support Policy

Department of Education

Office of Special Education and Rehabilitative Services

- **Marlene Simon-Burroughs**, Associate Division Director

**Meeting Purpose:**

The Fixing America’s Surface Transportation (FAST) Act requires that the Coordinating Council on Access and Mobility (CCAM) develop and publish a strategic plan outlining the Council’s approach to strengthen interagency collaboration, address outstanding recommendations, and eliminate burdensome regulatory barriers.

The CCAM convened on December 12, 2016 to review and provide feedback on the draft CCAM Strategic Framework.

**Agenda:**

- 1. Welcome and Introductions: Carolyn Flowers, Acting Administrator of the Federal Transit Administration, Department of Transportation**
  - a. Personal mobility is essential to living a happy, healthy, and productive life. However, millions of Americans are unable to transport themselves or pay for transportation due to physical or mental disability, income, or age. If these Americans are unable to participate in their communities, both their lives and the lives of their communities are poorer.
  - b. Congress directed the CCAM to develop a strategic plan that outlines how the Council will strengthen interagency collaboration, address outstanding recommendations, and eliminate regulatory and statutory barriers to coordination.
  - c. In the July meeting of the CCAM, the Council agreed on three key themes to include in the strategic framework:
    - i. Access to Services;
    - ii. Federal Laws and Regulations; and
    - iii. Innovation and Technology.
  - d. When CCAM agencies work together, there are benefits for all, including increased ridership, enhanced mobility, greater cost-effectiveness, and improved service delivery.
  - e. The FTA is committed to the success of the CCAM and the completion of a strong and actionable strategic framework.
  
- 2. Industry Insights: Marianne Stock, Rural and Targeted Programs Division Chief at the Federal Transit Administration, Department of Transportation**
  - a. The Virtual Transit Agency Update on the Coordinating Council on Access and Mobility originally scheduled for December 7 will be rescheduled due to unforeseen events at the American Public Transit Association.
  - b. The FTA will host additional industry sessions in 2017 to gather input on the CCAM Strategic Framework.
  - c. Please contact Danielle Nelson with questions or suggestions on future industry events.

3. CCAM Mission and Vision Discussion

CCAM Mission		
Proposed	Updated	Feedback
<p>The Coordinating Council for Access and Mobility issues recommendations and implements activities that improve the efficiency, availability, and accessibility of transportation services for transportation-disadvantaged populations.</p>	<p>The Coordinating Council on Access and Mobility issues policy recommendations and implements activities that improve the availability, accessibility, and efficiency of transportation for targeted populations.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The mission statement should highlight the CCAM's role in issuing policy statements.</li> <li>Efficiency, availability, and accessibility should be reordered to place an emphasis on access.</li> <li>The term "transportation-disadvantaged populations" has a negative connotation and may inadvertently exclude some populations or communities. Suggested replacement terms include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Transit-dependent</li> <li>All populations</li> <li>Vulnerable populations</li> <li>Targeted populations</li> </ul> </li> <li>The CCAM mission statement should be clear and specific so it can be easily understood by external stakeholders and future Council members.</li> </ul>

CCAM Vision		
Proposed	Updated	Feedback
<p>Enable access to seamless, efficient, and cost-effective transportation services for all Americans</p>	<p>Equal access to coordinated transportation for all Americans</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The vision statement should resonate with both the customer and the members of the CCAM.</li> <li>CCAM Members recommended the following terms to describe the future of transportation in the vision statement: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Innovative</li> <li>Equal</li> <li>Coordinated</li> <li>Customer-Focused</li> </ul> </li> <li>Though the CCAM is focused on older Americans, individuals with low income, and disabled persons, their work should benefit all Americans.</li> <li>The CCAM may want to consider developing a set of values or principles that will guide all Council initiatives.</li> </ul>

4. Goal 1 Working Session

Goal 1		
Proposed	Updated	Feedback
Improve Access to Essential Services	Improve Access to the Community through Transportation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The term “essential services” implies that the CCAM works only to improve access to government services; however, the CCAM aims to enhance general mobility.</li> <li>Improving mobility improves the well-being of both the individual and the community by improving individuals’ ability to contribute their skills and incomes to the community.</li> <li>CCAM Members suggested rephrasing the goal in the following ways: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Improve Access to Essential Services to Improve Mobility</li> <li>Improve Mobility and Community Access</li> <li>Improve Access to the Community</li> <li>Improve Transportation Access to the Community</li> <li>Improve Access to Essential Services and Community Involvement</li> <li>Improve Community Access to Transportation</li> <li>Improve Community Access Through Transportation</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

Goal 1 Objectives		
Proposed	Updated	Feedback
Revise Policy to Remove Barriers to Transportation Access	Reduce Federal Policy Barriers to Coordinated Transportation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>CCAM Members recommended rephrasing Objective 1 to clarify the level of policy (federal vs. state vs. local) and highlight the importance of coordination. Suggestions include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Reduce policy and regulatory barriers to transportation access</li> <li>Reduce barriers to coordinated transportation</li> <li>Reduce policy barriers to coordinated transportation</li> <li>Reduce federal policy barriers to coordinated transportation</li> <li>Improve access to transportation through coordination</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
	Increase State and Local Transportation Coordination	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Many transportation coordination barriers exist at the state and local level. The CCAM should include an objective around promoting state and local transportation coordination.</li> </ul>
Promote Public Awareness of Available Transportation Services	Promote Public Awareness of Available Transportation Options	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The term services is limiting and implies that the CCAM is focused only on improving transportation to social services. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>“Options” is more inclusive.</li> </ul> </li> <li>This objective will include engaging state and local organizations.</li> </ul>
Incorporate Innovative Technologies in Human Services Transportation	Incorporate the Use of Innovative Technologies in Coordinated Transportation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>CCAM Members suggested changing “human services transportation” to emphasize the importance of coordination.</li> <li>The use of innovative technologies will also likely improve the cost-effectiveness of transportation options.</li> </ul>

5. Goal 2 Working Session

Goal 2		
Proposed	Updated	Feedback
Enhance Cost-Effectiveness of Human Services Transportation	Enhance Cost-Effectiveness of Coordinated Transportation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The term “human services transportation” is not broad enough to include all types of transportation that some CCAM agencies. CCAM Members suggested changing “human services transportation” to emphasize the importance of coordination.</li> <li>Return on investment (ROI) will eventually be included as a measure to evaluate progress towards the achievement of this goal.</li> </ul>

Goal 2 Objectives		
Proposed	Updated	Feedback
Share Transportation Costs Equitably Among Stakeholders	Enable Equitable Cost Sharing Among State and Local Stakeholders	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The term “stakeholders” needs to be clarified. The framework should indicate that the Federal Government will work to enable cost sharing at the state and local level.</li> </ul>
Develop Framework for Standard Cost Reporting	Develop Framework for Transportation Cost Reporting	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The term “cost” needs to be clarified as CCAM member agencies use different definitions of this term.</li> <li>CCAM Members noted the importance of reducing duplication and affordability for riders.</li> </ul>
	Promote the Adoption of Cost Sharing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The development of cost sharing principles will not necessarily lead to cost-effective transportation services.</li> <li>The Council should also consider promoting the adoption of cost sharing principles that will enable states and local communities to realize efficiencies in transportation service delivery.</li> </ul>

6. Goal 3 Working Session

Goal 3		
Proposed	Updated	Feedback
Strengthen Interagency Partnerships and Industry Collaboration	Strengthen Interagency Partnerships and Collaboration with State, Local, and Industry Groups	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>CCAM Members identified the need to include state and local groups in the Council’s collaboration efforts.</li> </ul>

Goal 3 Objectives		
Proposed	Updated	Feedback
Refresh the CCAM Operating Model	Refresh the CCAM Operating Model	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>This objective is focused on federal collaboration.</li> <li>Another objective should be added that addresses outreach to state, local, and industry groups.</li> </ul>
Streamline Transportation Mobility Research	Coordinate Transportation Initiatives for Targeted Populations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The term “coordinate” better represents the mission of the CCAM than the term “streamline.”</li> <li>The term “research” is too limiting as there may be programs outside of research projects that present opportunities for the federal coordination. The term “initiatives” is more all-encompassing.</li> <li>This objective may include additional federal partners outside of CCAM membership.</li> </ul>

	Expand Opportunities for External Input	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The CCAM should reach out on a regular basis to state and local governments, industry groups, and nonprofit organizations to get their input on CCAM initiatives.</li> </ul>
--	---	---

7. Goal 4 Working Session

Goal 4		
Proposed	Updated	Feedback
Establish Future Model for Human Services Transportation	Demonstrate Future Models for Coordinated Transportation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The term “model” should be plural in case the CCAM decided to fund more than one pilot program.</li> <li>CCAM Members suggested changing “human services transportation” to emphasize the importance of coordination.</li> <li>The term “establish” does not fully encompass the activities that the CCAM plans to undertake. Council Members recommended the following changes: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Explore Future Models for Coordinated Transportation</li> <li>Test and Evaluate Future Models for Coordinated Transportation</li> <li>Demonstrate and Evaluate Future Models for Coordinated Transportation</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

Goal 4 Objectives		
Proposed	Updated	Feedback
Launch CCAM Pilot Program	Implement and Evaluate CCAM Pilot Programs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Over the life of the FAST Act, the CCAM will identify best practices. This objective indicates that the Council will test these practices in the field and evaluate their effectiveness.</li> <li>The term “program” should be plural in case the CCAM chooses to implement more than one pilot.</li> <li>Measuring the results of the pilot programs is critical to understanding their success.</li> <li>CCAM members recommended using the term “implement” instead of “launch.”</li> </ul>

8. Next Steps and Action Items

- a. FTA: Send revised version of the Strategic Framework to CCAM partners.
- b. CCAM Members: Review updated Strategic Framework and send comments.
- c. CCAM Members: Reach out to Danielle Nelson with recommended industry groups to include in future industry touchpoints.
- d. CCAM Members and Support Team: Provide talking points to member agencies that promote the Strategic Framework and justify Council participation.